



External Post Evaluation

Of the Project

“Empowerment for Change – Learning for Life”

Funded by:
Austrian Development Agency (ADA) & HOPE'87

Implemented by:
Hashoo Foundation, Chitral

Technical Assistance by:
Hashoo Foundation Core Office, Islamabad

July, 2009

Conducted By:
Mohammad Israr Khan Khattak
Independent Consultant

TABLE OF CONTENTS:

TABLE OF CONTENTS:..... **II**

PREFACE: **III**

ACRONYMS:..... **IV**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY: **V**

BACKGROUND:..... **7**

INTRODUCTION: **8**

 SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION:.....8

METHODOLOGY:..... **8**

 REVIEW OF SECONDARY DATA:8

 FIELD VISIT:9

 LIMITATIONS:.....9

FINDINGS:..... **10**

RECOMMENDATIONS / SUGGESTIONS: **11**

ANALYSIS OF EVALUATION QUESTIONS:..... **13**

 CAPACITY BUILDING OF THE LOCAL PARTNERS: 17

 PROVISION OF BOARDING FACILITY FOR 50 WOMEN IN CHITRAL: 17

 ONE-YEAR LIFE SKILLS TRAINING (LST) PROGRAMME: 17

 300 WOMEN ARE ENROLLED IN THE LST PROGRAMME:..... 17

 MOBILIZATION AND SENSITIZATION IN THE COMMUNITIES:..... 18

PROVISION OF SAFE, SECURE LIVING ENVIRONMENT AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT THROUGH SKILLS TRAINING: **19**

PROJECT CONTRIBUTION IN CREATING AWARENESS FOR FEMALE EDUCATION AND SKILLS TRAINING:..... **21**

PROJECT SUCCESS IN EMPOWERING WOMEN TO PURSUE HIGHER EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT: **22**

 FINDINGS:..... 24

CAPACITY BUILDING OF LOCAL PARTNERS:..... **25**

LESSONS LEARNT FROM THE PROJECT APPROACH TO EMPOWERING WOMEN: **26**

 LESSONS LEARNT DURING PROJECT EXECUTION:..... 26

 LESSONS LEARNT FROM PROJECT APPROACH TOWARDS WOMEN EMPOWERMENT: 27

COSTS BENEFIT ANALYSIS:..... **28**

 COST EFFICIENCY:..... 28

 COST EFFECTIVENESS:..... 30

 CONCLUSION:..... 31

ANNEXES:

Annex A: Evaluation framework

Annex B (I & II): Project Activities Schedule Sheet, Statistical sheet for data validation

Annex C: Results and Activities Summary Sheet

Annex D: Batch wise LST Programme data

Annex E: Questionnaire for boarders, non-boarders and FGD discussion topics for students and parents/community

Annex F: Tabulation of questionnaires

Annex G: Itinerary for Chitral visit

Preface:

Opening our eyes and acting vigorously in favor of lives and future of the poorest women is probably the single most important key to achieving the millennium development goals by 2015

Women have always been marginalized and relegated to the status of subjugated class in our society. Due to lack of implementation of plans, local communities especially women have remained outside the scope and benefits of government schemes and programmes.

Women have not actively participated in their emancipation due to their lack of economic independence and illiteracy. There is a need to address the issue by raising the status of women. The key lies in women empowerment through economic self-sufficiency and higher awareness levels on social, political and legal issues through mobilization.

Women empowerment shows how women's decision directs their lives into private and public sphere of activity. Women empowerment encourages individual and social assertions of women rights and responsibilities, and urges women to assist one another in fulfilling these quests. It does not mean that it intends to enable women would seize power from men; rather it helps them get a fair share and live cooperatively rather than competitively.

The reason for women openness to change is not so much that they know better than men, but rather women are hurting more than men in their current circumstances. They are more desperate to make changes to relieve or transform their pressure or restricted lives.

I am personally and professionally indebted to many people for the ideas and facts presented here. I must thank the women interviewed during my field visit for research. The HF Chitral staff was very supportive, open and courageous to talk about weaknesses. Discussion on LS Program with Ms. Shagufta was helpful to understand real essence of these modules and the project. I must thank Ms. Sadiqa Batool for encouraging me to apply for this study. She extended full cooperation from the very beginning of this evaluation study in terms of project data/documents, boarding and lodging both at Islamabad and Chitral.

I will particularly thank my family, parents, brothers and sisters, who prayed for me and encouraged me to take the challenge again along with my other personal and professional commitments.

I am also thankful to my very dear friend Mr. Yasir Iqbal Khan for sharing his family time with me for holding very fruitful discussions and generating nice ideas for conducting the study. Last but not least, I thank my student Ms. Seemi Bano for helping me out in validating facts/data with various progress reports of the project despite her thesis work at Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU).

Mohammad Israr Khan Khattak
Independent Development Consultant

Acronyms:

ADA	Austrian Development Agency
CGC	City Girls College
CMDC	Chital Model Degree College
CT	Certificate of Teacher
ELT	English Language Training
FGDs	Focused Group Discussion
HF	Hashoo Foundation
HOPE'87	Hundreds of Original Projects for Employment
HDRC	Human Development Resource Centre
ICT	Information & Communication Technology
IP	Implementing Partner
LSO	Local Support Organization
LST	Life Skills Training
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PRA	Participatory Rural/Rapid Appraisal
ProDoc	Project Document
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PTC	Primary Teacher Certificate
SET	Senior English Teacher
ToT	Training of Trainers
VO	Village Organization
WEC	Women Empowerment Centre

Executive Summary:

The Austrian Development Agency (ADA) funded HOPE'87 to implement the project in Chitral in 2007. Hashoo Foundation (HF) is the local partner in the project. The goal of the project was to contribute to the empowerment of women from the North West Frontier Province (NWFP). In order to encourage women to continue their education the project provided a secure and learning environment for 300 women from remote areas of Chitral. In this regard a Women Empowerment Center (WEC) is established where residents and non-residents are trained in LST Programme.

The final evaluation is conducted to review the progress towards achieving the project's targets and objectives, outcome, efficiency and cost-effectiveness. The final evaluation tried to involve an appropriate number of all interested parties. The evaluation was undertaken by an independent consultant with the support of the HOPE'87 and HF Islamabad and Chitral offices.

1. The project was completed in due course of time but one of its main components i.e. Life Skills Training started late by June 2007 mainly due to bad weather, unexpected heavy snowfall, blocked transportation channels, transfer of funds and deteriorated law and order situation due to military operation in a religious institution in Islamabad. Therefore, almost 70 percent of project activities could not be launched on time as per project Work Plan and hence shifted/adjusted accordingly.
2. The Implementing Partner (IP) established Women Empowerment Center (WEC) with residential facility for 58 women at a time (more than 50 per year as per Project Document), properly renovated, staffed and provided with necessary equipments and materials. During the project duration accommodation facility was provided to 64 women out of which 6 left after completing their training. On the whole more than 100 women resided during the project phase. Training and residential facility of WEC was rented out to various organizations during winter for conducting specific training such as "Classroom Management for Teachers", etc. for targeted women. More than 25 women acquired temporary residence during these training in the WEC.
3. Sense of enlightenment towards women empowerment, now, sufficiently prevails among community if we compare the overall project progress with criticism faced at the hands of religious and influential people in the beginning especially when clapping and roaring voice of the students was heard outside the WEC compound during an internal ceremony. The project was successful in ensuring its acceptance among all its stakeholders especially the religious faction of Chitral Town.
4. A total of 64 resident women were trained in Life Skills Training (LST) Programme, whereas 218 non-residents were also successfully trained. Out of total targeted 300 trainees, 282 (94 percent) women completed their training successfully in the LST Programme.
5. Without taking into account one important deliverable i.e. community mobilization, the project was thirty two percent (32%) cost efficient in comparison with the local market. The Project was found cost effective since such quality services are hardly available at a single point in the local market.
6. Cost recovery of the project was found out up to 44% per unit and the rest of 56% expenditure per unit was covered by the project.
7. Data management of training component i.e. training and trainees is required to be improved further as progress reports revealed different approach and method of calculations as compared to the one utilized during evaluation. For instance, some of the batch numbers in the information sheet generated during evaluation study is different than the batch numbers in progress reports .

8. Awareness about the project has been made sufficiently by utilizing all the necessary forums such as district administration, religious, educational institutions, LSO's and other organizations at village level.
9. One-year LST Programme including ELT and ICT could not be made operational due to delay in the project implementation as mentioned above. Hence, LST cycle was reduced to 6 months without compromising the contents which proved successful, later on, in achieving targets, curtailing dropouts and keeping trainees engaged.
10. Similarly transportation facility for women trainees at WEC was one of the project success factors.
11. Project implementation and management was good as far as the quality of WEC and organizing LS, EL and ICT training are concerned. Local trainers were selected based on their understanding of certain modules of LS. Proper adjustments were also made when required by the project team regarding trainers' relocation.
12. Non-residents' training at Chitral Town was found satisfactory as compared to non-residents training at Booni. Firstly, the project was unable to carry out regular monitoring and supervision presumably due to insufficient funds for transportation and secondly the facilities available at Booni were not as good as at WEC.
13. According to the resident students, the security and safety of the WEC was outstanding. Women feel more encouraged to continue further education after becoming confident, self-reliant, disciplined, and skillful in English language and proficient in computer use. According to trainees, positive changes have been witnessed by their family members in their personality after acquiring residence at WEC.
14. Most of the trainees thought that training had greater impact for residents of WEC rather than on non-residents. English language and Information/Communication Technology trainings were appreciated generally and were found helpful and important in acquiring jobs and retaining them by performing well.
15. The interviewees opined that the LST was very much relevant to address their learning gaps as they were about to step into practical life either by getting employment or pursuing higher education. The LST Programme helped them in acquiring certain skills which were not available in the market. According to the boarders of WEC, the training has brought them almost at par with other students in their college. These other students are mostly belonging to Chitral Town and happened to be much confident due to better education and exposure. Now after receiving training and having some exposure WEC boarders feel very confident to compete their classmates very easily.
16. After the training we feel more responsible regarding study and further education. The group agreed that the training had helped them in becoming more responsible and responsive.
17. During the Focused Group Discussion (FGD), it was found out that parents don't accept increase in the monthly fee for WEC as the people are mostly poor especially in the remote areas and hence can't afford expensive education. Therefore, cost recovery could only reach up to 44 percent only. The project has provided some financial support by granting subsidies to the women from under privileged remote area by not charging fee during winter vacation.
18. According to the principals of colleges in Chitral Town, the quality & a wide range of facilities provided by WEC are very high and that's the reason they are expensive.
19. On the grassroots level still there is need for more work in terms of community mobilization and gender sensitization especially in Southern Chitral and other Sunni population areas.

Background:

The Austrian Development Agency (ADA) funded Hope'87 (an Austrian NGO) to implement the project in Chitral in 2007, Hashoo Foundation being the local partner. The goal of the project was to contribute towards the empowerment of women from the North West Frontier Province (NWFP).

HOPE'87 and HF's policies are in line with government initiatives of Millennium Development Goals and the organizations are working, for creating enabling environment for marginalized communities through advocacy, research and enhanced access to quality education, skills development, income generation and healthcare. Keeping this goal in view, HF existing Women Empowerment Centers (WEC) worked towards the empowerment of women, as the name suggests, by increasing access to higher education especially for women from some of the remotest regions of the country. At the same time, it gave them an enhanced sense of confidence and abilities to deal with the increasing demands of professional and personal aspects of modern day life.

The rationale for selecting Chitral was that despite rapid technological and infrastructure advancement, Chitral remained one of the most economically and socially disadvantaged district in the country. The people of the area are mainly dependent on agriculture for subsistence and the population is growing herby decreasing the ration of available resources and consumption, resulting in widespread poverty. With such little resources available, most families are reluctant to educate their children and girls are especially suffering the most under these conditions. The remote villages of Chitral have some access to primary and secondary level schools but colleges and universities are only located in the central city, which demands that the students have to leave their homes in villages to be able to acquire higher education. Access to higher education, especially for women also depends on the availability of a secure living environment at affordable rates away from their communities.

In order to overcome these problems, the project was designed with the following objective:

- To provide a secure and supportive living and learning environment for 300 women from NWFP

Key activities of the project included:

- Establishment of a women empowerment and training centre
- Conducting mobilization and sensitization process in respective communities
- Provide life skills training (inclusive of English Language, information and communication technology and Life Skills through training workshops)
- Capacity building of local staff
- Monitoring and Evaluation

Introduction:

The final evaluation was conducted to review the progress towards achieving the project's targets and objectives, outcome, efficiency and cost-effectiveness. The final evaluation tried to involve an appropriate degree of all interested parties. The evaluation was undertaken by an independent consultant with the support of the HF Islamabad and Chitral.

Scope of the Evaluation:

The evaluation is aimed at assessing the following questions as to how far and to what extent:

1. Project objectives have been accomplished
2. Project activities have been undertaken
3. Project team was successful in providing a safe and secure living environment and empowering women through life skills training programme?
4. Project contributed to creating awareness among communities for female education and skills training?
5. Capacity of the local partners has been built?
6. Project successful in empowering women sufficiently to either pursue higher education or be employed?
7. To identify the lessons learnt from this project approach to empowering women
8. And to analyze the cost efficiency and effectiveness of the project

Methodology:

The Project External Evaluation mainly focused on secondary data related to project i.e. ProDoc, Project work plan, various progress reports, meeting minutes, internal monitoring reports/surveys, etc. were thoroughly reviewed. In order to formulate relevant monitoring tools for carrying out different type of analysis an evaluation framework was developed in which stakeholders were distributed on the basis of evaluation questions.

Review of Secondary Data:

The project team produced sufficient amount of documentation as per donor requirements and compiled monthly, quarterly, bi-annual and annual reports. PSC meetings are one of the important aspects of the project which were conducted mostly on monthly basis in which HF Chitral use to participate through telephone and HF Islamabad and representative from HOPE'87 were participating.

The secondary data was thoroughly reviewed and evaluation tools were developed on its basis. The evaluation tools include the following;

1. Evaluation framework
2. Results and activities summary sheet
3. Statistical sheet for data validation
4. Project activities schedule sheet
5. Questionnaire for residents, non-residents
6. FGD discussion topics for students and parents/community
7. Itinerary for Chitral visit

Field Visit:

To validate and verify the progress made and processes undertaken through various activities by the project, a field visit was planned and a detailed itinerary was prepared with the help of Hashoo Foundation Chitral.

During the field visit to Chitral and other areas, views pertaining to various evaluation aspects of project stakeholders were collected for analysis. Emphasis was laid mainly on the project's targets, objectives, outcome, cost efficiency and effectiveness.

Interviews and FGDs with following individuals/ group were carried out:

1. Meeting with project team and regional staff
2. A group of 05 women students of WEC were separately interviewed at Booni, Dolomultz and one on telephone
3. Separate interviews were carried out with 21 women from different education institutes 04 at Booni, One MBBS student at Denin, three students and four teachers at Chitral Town, nine (09) at Dolomultz
4. Focused Group Discussion (FGD) was carried out with a group of 07 women who undergone Life Skills Training (LST) program at Booni. Three (03) of them remained residents of WEC
5. One (01) Focused Group Discussion (FDG) with parents and respective community at Dolomutzh
6. Interviews with higher education institutes (02 principals at Balach area)
7. Project staff of HF Chitral including facilitators, trainers and support staff of WEC

Limitations:

Following are the limitations of the evaluation study:

- The schedule of the evaluation was tough due to very short time for the evaluation study
- The examinations in colleges were over and hence boarders went back to their homes which were mostly situated in far flung areas of Chitral
- The sample size for interviewing boarders was 15 initially including three women who attained job, nonetheless, only 05 WEC boarders were relied upon as boarders are living in the far flung area of Chitral. Going for a single interview in remote areas would have taken a day long. Therefore, Booni was suggested as there were 03 boarders and 04 non-boarders were interviewed
- The District Chitral administration i.e. DCO and the Nazim and other many responsible authorities were busy in making arrangements for Shandoor festival where the President and the Prime Minister of Pakistan and Chief Minister NWFP were expected to come this year

Findings:

- The project was completed in due course of time but one of its main components i.e. Life Skills Training started late by June 2007 mainly due to bad weather, unexpected heavy snowfall, blocked transportation channels, transfer of funds and deteriorated law and order situation due to military operation in a religious institution in Islamabad. Therefore, almost 70 percent of project activities could not be launched on time as per project Work Plan and hence shifted/adjusted accordingly.
- The WEC was established with residential facility for 58 women at a time (more than 50 per year as per Project Document), properly renovated, staffed and provided with necessary equipments and materials. During the project duration accommodation facility was provided to 64 women out of which 6 left after completing their training. On the whole more than 100 women resided during the project phase. Training and residential facility of WEC was also rented out to various organizations during winter for conducting specific training such as "Classroom Management for Teachers", etc. for targeted women. More than 25 women acquired temporary residence during these training in the WEC.
- As per ProDoc, out of 100 targeted resident trainees, 64 were trained in LST Programme, whereas 218 non-residents were also successfully trained. As compared to the total planned target of 300, 282 (94 percent) women were trained in the LST Programme with 94 percent successful completion.
- One-year LST Programme including ELT and ICT could not be operationalized due to delay in the project implementation and hence LST cycle was reduced to 06 months without compromising on the contents.
- The 06 months LST Programme was proved successful in achieving targets, curtailing dropout and keeping the trainees engaged. Similarly transportation facility for women trainees at WEC was one of the project success factors.
- Project implementation and management was good as far as the quality of WEC and organizing LS, EL and IC training are concerned. Local trainers were selected based on their understanding in certain modules of LS. Proper adjustments were made as when required by the project team regarding trainers' relocation.
- Without taking into account one important deliverable i.e. community mobilization, the project was thirty two percent (32%) cost efficient in comparison with the local market. The Project was found cost effective since such quality services are hardly available at a single point in the local market.
- Cost recovery of the project was found out as 44%.
- Awareness about the project has been made sufficiently by utilizing all the necessary forums.
- On the grassroots level still there is more work to do in terms of community mobilization and gender sensitization especially in Southern Chitral and other Sunni population areas.
- Data management of training component i.e. training and trainees is required to be improved further as progress reports revealed different approach and method of calculations as compared to the one utilized during evaluation. For instance, some of the batch numbers in the information sheet generated during evaluation study is different than the batch numbers in progress reports.
- According to the resident students, the security and safety of the WEC was outstanding.
- Women feel more encouraged to continue further education after becoming confident, self-reliant, disciplined, skill full in English language and proficient in computer use.

- Trainees feel confident, self-reliant and very different as compared to their earlier personality. Positive changes have also been witnessed by their family members in the personality of the women who resided at WEC.
- Most of the trainees thought that training had greater impact on residents of WEC rather than non-residents. However, English language and Information/Communication Technology training was appreciated generally and termed it helpful and important for the students for acquiring jobs and then retaining it by performing well.
- According to the principals of colleges in Chitral Town, the quality of facilities provided by WEC was very high and that's the reason they were expensive.
- The interviewees opined that the LST was very much relevant to them as they were about to step into practical life either by getting employment or pursue higher education. The LST Programme helped them in acquiring certain skills which they would have never learnt. According to the residents, the training has brought them almost at par with their classmates in colleges as they belong to Chitral Town and happened to be much confident due to better education and exposure. Now after receiving training and having some exposure WEC residents feel very confident to compete their classmates very easily.
- After the training the students feel more responsible regarding study and further education. The group agreed that the training had helped them becoming more responsible and responsive.
- Non-residents' training at Chitral Town was found satisfactory as compared to non-residents training at Booni. As the project was unable to carry out regular monitoring and supervision and secondly the facilities available at Booni were not as good as at WEC.
- During the Focused Group Discussion (FGD), it was found out that parents won't appreciate an increase in the monthly fee for WEC as the people are mostly poor especially in the remote areas and hence can't afford expensive education. The project has provided some financial support by granting subsidies to the women from under privileged remote area by not charging fee during winter vacation.

Recommendations / Suggestions:

- Log frame of the project should be made explicit in terms of output, outcome and goal for internal use in order to make project staff easily understand internal logic of the project. Result Based Management (RBM) tools may be used for internal use, if not required by the donors, for understanding logical relationships between/among various project components.
- Project planning in areas where weather condition is a major risk, may be carried out keeping in view the past experiences and predictions of Metrological department. Similarly, risks and assumptions may appropriately be categorized according to their definition for example weather condition being an external out of control factor that can negatively affect the project, so this is a risk.
- IP should always device a mitigation strategy for identified risks and assumptions for the project right at the beginning of implementation phase.
- The project should have all the necessary definitions in ProDoc such as successful completion of a module and a training, dropout, non-resident trainees, residential duration for women in WEC.
- Deviation from the original project implementation strategy in terms of duration of the Life Skills Training cycle may have resulted disturbance for students due to their academic schedule..... later below in report a comment contradicts to it that it did not have any

affect... As this aspect was not considered while squeezing LST cycle. The project should always be mindful of individual targets set by the students besides its own.

- Project management becomes efficient and effective if there is a Management Information System (MIS) for the project. It helps the management in timely decision making through timely reporting. The project does not have any monthly or quarterly database for information and records.
- LST Programme should have been implemented as envisaged because originally it was more participatory, practical assignments, role plays, seminars, workshops, etc. if you want have this point then highlight against what .. what was envisaged and what was nto implemented, be more specific as against _____ -
- Community mobilization and sensitization was one of the project result's activity, however, the project hasn't carried out specific and relevant sub-activities in terms of community mobilization and sensitization. The leaflets were only promotional in nature, these may be made educational. Community participation and gender sensitization training may also be carried out for mobilizing community for women education (not project activity. Needs rewording. Mass education for the female segment of society is not a project activity. Sensitization to the extent of availability of hostel facility along with allied activities is part of the project. Was this carried out effectively or not needs to be evaluated). Mass level awareness may have been easily carried out through Radio Spot Shows.
- Engaging men and boys for community mobilization and sensitization also prove very helpful in achieving long lasting success in similar initiatives.
- Possibilities of joint venture with educational institutes can be explored in order to involve them for creating awareness about women empowerment especially in Southern Chitral.
- Providing scholarship or incentive in the form of residential facility at WEC to secondary level qualified women in Southern Chitral can prove to be a good communication tool for exposing and attracting the attention of parents to available opportunity which at least put them in a thinking process. This can prove to be a breaking point to pave way for women empowerment in a conservative society.
- Flexible fee structure for poorest of the poor and fixed one for well of may be introduced in WEC.
- The regional and WEC staff need to be provided training on marketing and sustainable development.

Analysis of Evaluation Questions:

ACCOMPLISHMENT OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES:

Women Empowerment:

As being the overall goal of the project i.e. empowerment of women, the project has made tremendous contribution in building confidence of women in their skills and abilities. Due to the project interventions, many women are now encouraged to either pursue higher education or to get employed. During the evaluation, 05 resident women and 21 non-residents have shared that they themselves were encouraged and observed the same in their fellow trainees to make use of the confidence and other skills acquired by setting their own future course of actions.



The project has come across hurdles by the religious fundamentalists who opposed the WEC, however, the project has been able to ensure its acceptability. The project came out successfully from the incident happened at the very beginning when clapping and roaring of women during an internal party was heard outside by the community which resulted in a huge criticism.

WEC Established:

As per results 1 of ProDoc establishment of WEC in Chitral with a capacity to accommodate 50 women per year was the target. In WEC accommodation was only available initially for 31 and later on to a maximum of 39 women during the first year which was increased to 58 in the beginning of the second year. Providing residence to 50 women per year meant accommodation for 100 women during the project life i.e. two and half years. Six (06) women who lived and received training during the first year had left WEC in order to pursue higher education in Peshawar and Islamabad.



We did explain it is not a non realistic target, a women staying at the WEC for two years shall be calculated twice as it is only because of WEC that she could continue her studies?? In project documents it was never mentioned that it will be 100 different women.. Apparently the project was unable to provide training to 100 resident women as per the work plan. This seems non-realistic target in the project design as women studying in first or third year classes in different colleges will have to continue their second and fourth year classes respectively and hence could not change their residence. Therefore, accommodation facility could reach up to 58 during the second year as compared to 39 in the first year. If it was a realistic target then we can conclude that the IP has not been able to achieve the desired target of

providing accommodation to 100 different women by adopting other alternatives such as provision of residence only to second and fourth year students of intermediate and graduation level respectively.

Provision of transport facility for the trainees was one of the attractive features of the project. As women mobility is a huge problem due to unavailability of local transport. Only taxis (private passenger vehicle) are available which are expensive and occasionally not very much appreciated by women when they are alone.

One-Year Life Skills Training Programme was Operationalized:

As per Result 2 of ProDoc, the project has to operationalized one-year LST programme which include ELT and ICT as well and 02 cycles of this training programme were targeted to carry out during the project phase. Training programme for the very first batch of WEC's residents commenced during June 2007 due to delay in the implementation of the project by 05 (five) months. In order to get technical guidance from HF Core Office, the matter was discussed during PSC and it was recommended to reduce the LST cycle to 6 months instead of 01 year. The alternative strategy was selected keeping in view the targets which could not be met otherwise. It was good decision as it helped in curtailing dropout, however, it shows non-realistic approach at design time of the project which could have been corrected by involving local partners in project planning.



The project has been able to conduct 10 (Ten) LST cycles of 6 months each. A total of 282 (94 percent) women successfully completed LST programme. Out of total 282 women, only 64 residents (100 instead) of WEC and 218 non-residents have completed the training. The actual target for resident trainees was 100 but only 64 (06 trained women left WEC later on) could be trained as the residential facility in WEC was only available for 58 women until towards the end of project.



It was found through interviews with various women (residents/non-residents) that reducing one-year training cycle to 06 months did not affect their academic studies (statement is contradictory with previous assertion). Interviews with 05 WEC residents and 15 non-residents reveal that women took keen interest in training and benefited a lot from it. Therefore, these training don't affect their academic studies rather improved their performance in academics in comparison with their classmates. It was also found that due to skill development some of the women trainee had been able to cope up with the



competition at higher educational institutions like Khyber Medical College Peshawar and NUML University Islamabad. Students of educational institutions of Peshawar and Islamabad are very confident and have much exposure as compared to Chitral's students. After the training, students from Chitral educational institutions have been able to find it easy to compete with students from rest of the country as they felt confident, self-reliant, have creative ideas to manage their studies and good in expressing themselves in English and can use computer for their benefit.

Capacity Building of Local Partner:

The capacity of the local partner i.e. HF Chitral was evaluated on the basis of available knowledge and expertise of project team to implement the project in an efficient and effective manner as indicated under Result 4 of the ProDoc. As for the technical expertise and decision making was concerned the regional office was suggesting initiatives and alternative options for improvement and achievement of project activities which were shared with HF Core Office for review and approval in PSC meetings.

The capacity of HF Chitral has been built through various training such as Performance Tools and Monitoring, Narrative and Financial Reporting, Training of Trainers (ToT) on LST. However, these training were not carried out on appropriate time at the start of the project. Monthly meetings of Project Steering Committee (PSC) were also held although on alternate interval for discussion of the project progress and technical assistance.

Understanding of local partner on various definitions such as successful training completion, partial completion and non-resident trainee due to non-realistic planning leads to conclude that probably during the design and planning of the project, HF Chitral staff was not fully involved while setting timeline and targets as most of these were not followed in letter and spirit. Ensuring participation of relevant stakeholder at the early stage of the project helps in carrying out realistic planning and common understanding of various performance aspects.



HOPE'87 and HF have also built the capacity of local partners at the village level by providing them social organization and communication skills training. The capacity building will have a certain impact over their performance to help the implementing agency in achieving sustainability by mobilizing the community at the grassroots level, however, indicators for training local partners such as LSOs, NGOs and Village Organizations are not explicitly given under Result 4 of the ProDoc.

PROJECT ACTIVITIES:

Overall Project Management:

As per annex-b and annex-c almost 70 percent of the project activities were delayed as were envisaged in project Work Plan due to reasons mentioned as per progress reports, such as bad weather, communication barriers, prolonged winter vacations of

One of our school teachers, Ms. Aysha - a graduate from religious institution (Madrassa) – was keen to take part in WEC LST programme. Eventually, she has participated in LST programme and termed it very helpful in building confidence and self-reliance in teachers and students.

Mr. Yar Mohammad
Principal CMDC

educational institutions and security threat due to situation emerged as a result of military operation on a religious institution in Islamabad. The critical path of the project was renting WEC building, its renovation, equipment purchase, hiring of WEC staff and selection of boarders as there was no lag time between these activities. Each of these activities has to start one after the other or in some cases almost simultaneously. Activities which have End to Start relationship i.e. start of an activity at the end of earlier one were taken care of by alterative options and hence the project implementation got delayed.

However, during evaluation visit it was found out from the staff members that project activities had actually started in the last quarter of 2006 on pilot basis in connivance with the ADA and all the expenditures made by HF during that phase were credited to the donor. The reasons mentioned for the delay should have been taken care of with the help of proper mitigation measures right at the beginning as these were already covered under risk and assumption for the project. For instance, materials necessary for



running WEC could have been managed from the local market even the furniture was also cheap as wood and carpenters both were available. However, it also depends on the financial, procurement and purchase policy of the HF. As for the availability of computers is concerned there are no hard and fast rules for carrying out ICT before or after LST or ELT i.e. ICT could be delayed up till July or August 2007. Project implementation could have been steered in right direction in an efficient way by involving workable strategies. This was necessary measure as the project approval timelines of the donor ADA did not match with the planned project initiation plan of the local partner. This was only possible through an understanding between HOPE'87 and HF and need not be highlighted.

LST programme was meant to be a complete set of 8 modules of life skills training along with ELT and ICT. The ProDoc has not emphasized on the LS cycle which only include 8 modules rather a LST programme. But the project progress reports have been mentioning number of trainees completing LS training cycle instead programme. There seems a slight difference of understanding about actual outcomes and outputs of the project among the staff members. Due to lack of proper definition of dropout, residents/non-residents and criteria for successful completion of a training program it became difficult to determine exact number of successful trainees any time during the project life cycle.

For example, according to the Interim Report for January – December 2007, there were 210 women trained in first LS cycle. The information on trainees was also not disaggregated by residents and non-residents. Similarly, there is a sizable group of students in Booni who did not receive ICT which was revealed during interviews with these students whereas it was confirmed as completed in the report referred earlier. Actual calculations during the evaluation visit were worked out which revealed that 48 women (31 residents and 17 non-residents) have successfully completed LST programme by December 2007. This is to note that actual calculations as per the definitions understandable from ProDoc and made clear with staff members



are different from the one mentioned in various progress reports.

The project management has carried out certain decisions which are worth appreciation as this helped in project steering in right direction on different occasions. In order to ensure successful completion of women in the LST programme, the LST cycle was reduced as prescribed above. This also helped in curtailing dropout from the training programme. Similarly, availability of LS trainers on temporary basis as per training need was good in reducing the cost of the trainer and producing a good lot of trainers in the area of project implementation. Similarly, engaging one full time Computer Trainer was a good and prompt step towards establishing an ICT center and ensuring its maintenance. HF Core office’s coordination and communication with HF Chitral was also good, however, PSC meetings could not be held on very regular intervals.

Capacity Building of the local partners:

Training on monitoring & performance tools was an essential activity and was reduced to 2 instead of 3 days. The first training as per 1st year Annual report was carried out in June 07 and second was held in December 07. Similarly 4-days ToT on LST programme was organized for the staff. Two (02) training on Narrative & Financial Reporting was also carried out during the project phase for the staff.

Provision of boarding facility for 50 women in Chitral:

- A boarding facility for 58 women was established. A building was rented and renovation carried out. Equipments and materials were provided which include the following:
 - Crockery and Kitchen utensils
 - Kerosene Heaters
 - Washing Machine
 - Bunker bedding and blankets
 - Cupboards
 - Pentium IV Computers
 - Printers
 - Multimedia projector
 - Television
 - Training videos
 - DVD player with VCR
- Vacancies were advertized and staff for WEC including Warden, Guards, Cook and Kitchen Assistant was hired.
- Two used vehicle (One Hiace 14 seater and One Double Cabin 4X4 Pickup) purchased during the first year. Both were overhauled later on for bringing them into regular use.

One-Year Life Skills Training (LST) Programme:

- LST programme is operational with a regular LS Facilitator and an ICT trainer. Services of LS trainers and EL trainers are hired for training on need basis.
- Four (04) days ToT on LS modules conducted for the HF Chitral staff. Trained 06 LS trainers through ToT and on-the-job on LS modules.
- LS cycle (comprised of 08 modules) reduced to 06 months from one year without reducing contents. So far 10 batches of LST programme carried out which include ELT and ICT.

300 women are enrolled in the LST Programme:

Batches	Date		Total Registered	Successfully Completed	80% or more Partial Completion	Less than 80% completion	R/NR
	From	To					
First	June 07	Dec 07	31	31		0	R

Second	June 07	Dec 07	40	17		23	NR
Third	Aug 07	Feb 08	35	25		10	8 R, 17 NR
Fourth	Aug 07	Feb 08	52	30		22	NR
Fifth	Dec 07	June 08	26	16		10	NR (Booni)
6 th & 7 th	Nov 07	June 08	75	75		0	NR (Decent Colle
Eighth	Apr 08	Sep 08	45	43		0	NR
Ninth	July 08	Dec 08	23	20		0	NR
Tenth	Sep 08	May 09	25	25		0	R
Total:			352 (5 dropped)	282	65	64 R, 218 NR	

The table above reveals details of each batch in which women registered, duration covered, successfully and partial completion of LST programme by women (residents & non-residents).

As per Result 3 of ProDoc the project has to train 300 women in LST programme. Out of which 100 were to be residents of WEC and 200 non-residents. The project has achieved to train 64 residents of WEC and 218 non-residents. According to the table above, out of 352 total enrolled women, 282 have successfully completed LST programme. A total of 65 women have partially completed training by undergoing either in LS and ICT or LS and ELT or any individual training. There is still some confusion about the batch of non-residents trained in Booni. As there were some students who did not receive ICT training which need to be reflected in the table above.

As there is no mention of dropout and successful completion definition of LST programme, therefore, it was concluded in consultation with project staff that women who undergo a complete cycle of LST programme which includes LS, EL and ICT modules will be termed as successful. However, as each component of the LST programme has its own significance in terms of skill development and counting them under dropout would undermine the worth of each single training module, therefore, the executing agency deserve to be appreciated for carrying out partial completions.

Mobilization and Sensitization in the Communities:

As per the ProDoc, the project was expected to distribute 3000 leaflets; however, 2600 were printed and disseminated in various educational institutions, religious centers and some of the government offices. The aim of the leaflet was to create awareness and provide education, whereas the contents of the leaflets are purely promotional.

The project was unable to launch any Radio programmes for education and information sharing with masses on a large scale about WEC. No technical assistance was observed on this activity in the progress reports of the executing agency.



Four (04) meetings with communities were organized with the help of different LSOs comprised of 14 local grassroots organizations at village level. The meetings were participated by a sizable number of men and women from the respective community in a mixed gathering. Due to these interventions capacity of the local partners were tried to enhance even further.

Sub-activities covered under community mobilization and sensitization still lack some of the important activities for promoting women empowerment and creating long lasting impact. Some of the most important activities are following:

- Need appraisal or need identification and prioritization through PRA tools
- Various strategies and alternatives to meet identified needs
- Community mobilization and gender sensitization training by involving men and boys in the first place
- Last but not least, publicity of WEC as instant available choice which is providing safe and secure environment for women empowerment

The evaluator seems to be unaware and distant from the ground realities where anything displaying women empowerment literature was a target of suicide bombers. Needs to reword in this context which has been a realtime factor

Provision of Safe, Secure Living Environment and Women Empowerment though Skills Training:

The success of the project team in the mentioned evaluation objective was determined on the following criteria:

1. Experience, qualification and behavior of the project staff
2. Location and infrastructure i.e. building construction and space
3. Availability of equipments and materials for individual and collective use such as a beds, quilts, cupboards, TV, washing machine, heaters, kitchen utensils, dinning, food, playground, washrooms, etc.
4. Relevant staff for WEC such as female warden, guards, cook,
5. Training facility such as spacious hall neatly renovated, multimedia projector, training material/module, training staff
6. A friendly and home like environment, supervision and maintenance
7. Sustainability aspects covered and rapport with different stakeholders was established

The project team was found energetic and disciplined as most of them are within the age bracket of 27 – 31 years except the Region Project Manager – an experienced, humble and polite person- who showed too much confidence in his staff for taking initiatives independently within the jurisdiction chalked out in the form of ToRs. All the staff members were sufficiently qualified and experienced in their

According to the resident students, the security and safety of the WEC was outstanding and the guards never allowed them to even roam around in hostel compound wall after sun set in order to avoid any mishap. Very high security was sometime taken as surprise by the boarders but this was indeed protecting us and providing safe and secure environment.

Resident of WEC, Booni, UC Charon, Mastooi

respective fields and were so close to each other that hardly any communication gap could be pointed out. Two of the mutual concerns of the project team were to provide best quality service to the women residents/non-resident trainees and sustaining the WEC.

The project office and WEC are situated close to each other in a street of residential area. Therefore, management and consistent check on the WEC residential facility was very much easy for the project staff. The WEC is a double story building made up of permanent construction of concrete with an enhanced boarding facility of 58 numbers. The covered area of the building is quite spacious with a dining and TV lounge, waiting lounge and a training hall on the upper story. The building has its own courtyard inside the compound wall and a big playground adjacent with the WEC building. As the location of the WEC was at a distance of almost 6 to 7 KM from the main Chitral town, therefore, transport facility was provided to the boarders and non-boarders for pick and drop service on very nominal charges.



All the necessary equipment, materials for individual and collective use have been provided in WEC. Three time meal is prepared by cook in the hostel and quality is ensured by a full time female warden who rarely takes leaves so that students are not alone. The other female staff members were very cooperative and extend every possible help in case of warden had to take leaves due to any urgency. The guards and cook, every one has been performing their duties with responsibility as there was consistent supervision.



The project team has provided sufficient facilities for imparting LST programme including ELT and ICT to the women for their skills development. A full time training facilitator and trainers, ELT trainer, and a full time ICT trainer were available. The training hall in the WEC was sufficiently accommodating a group of 35 with considerable ease at a time. A Multimedia projector, and other audio & visual aids were provided for the training venue. A computer lab is

It was came up during the FGD with women that WEC does not cost high in terms of facilities provided as compared to other hostels owned by other educational institutes. The transport facility which was free initially during the first year, is not free any more, however, the tran



equipped with 32 computers which are regularly maintained by the ICT trainer. The project staff is already trained in a ToT on LS modules and has better understanding. All these training such as LST, ELT and ICT is a unique combination which is not available any where in Chitral especially for women. Both the principals of City Girls College and Chitral Model Degree College (CMDC) appreciated WEC facilities and especially the LST programme.

The residents of WEC are provided with exposure opportunities through various seminars, workshops and exposure visits to different areas in Chitral and outside in the healthy tourist resorts. This had helped in making a very friendly relationship and understanding. The friendly environment of the WEC has been appreciated to a greater extent during interviews with residents and local non-residents.

The environment of the HF Chitral and WEC is very friendly as per the resident/non-resident students interviewed individually and FGDs conducted with students and parents. According to parents at Dolomutzh the facilities provided are very outstanding and parents feel encouraged to send their daughters to this hostel facility to pursue higher education in Chitral. All the students who were interviewed revealed satisfaction of their parents over the facilities of WEC and personality and character building of their daughters. The project staff has been able to provide all these quality services due to constant supervision of WEC staff members and keep on improving the standards.

Sustainability of WEC is ensured by renting out training hall to various organizations, provision of ICT, ELT and LST separately to groups of students from various colleges and teaching staff of various schools on a bit higher rates. The training component of HF Chitral is also known as Human Development Resource Centre (HDRC). Capacity of local grassroots level partners LSOs, NGOs and VO's have been built to mobilize community and share information about WEC, LST programme and its importance.



Project Contribution in Creating Awareness for Female Education and Skills Training:

As the mandate of the project was to enroll only those women who belong to far flung areas and studying in colleges situated in Chitral Town. Similarly, the project was supposed to provide skill development training to those women who either resides in WEC or resides in near by Chitral town and studying in colleges.

As this has become a usual practice in our society to think negative aspect of any opportunity or idea in the first place and I faced it while deciding to continue further education in Paragon College of Commerce Chitral. The first negative comment I received was that the college has boys too. But I argued that I was not going for boys at least rather for my studies and career. In this way I paved a way for taking admission during coming session.

Ms. Rahila Qamar D/O Qamaruddin
Non-resident trainee, Booni, UC Charon, Mastooj

For this the IP has to create awareness among the parents in particular and in among community in general that WEC offers a facility which can be availed by women and parents can satisfactorily send their daughter for residence if they get admission in colleges at Chitral Town. Accommodation was one of the primary concerns for parents who wish to send their daughters for admission in college; however, since parents were poor, they would prefer college hostels over WEC as they may think it is expensive.

In this case the project expected to create awareness about the facilities WEC is providing in empowering women. Therefore, with the help of LSOs and VO's at grassroots level the project endeavored to convey its message about female education and the importance of skills training in their life. So gender sensitization and community mobilization was carried out through distribution of project leaflets about WEC, organizing Women Day events and community meetings in which more than 30 village representatives participated. So far 04 such meetings have been organized in which communities and parents from more than 30 villages participated. This was shared by the project team that both men and women from the community participated in these meetings.



The IP has also made efforts to involve all the relevant stakeholders, such as government administration, district nazim, political leaders, religious institutions, educational institutions and college students. The IP has managed to share project leaflets which are more sort of promotional material instead educational and awareness raising material which has served the purpose to a satisfactory extent. For awareness on mass level, 03 Radio Spot Shows were to be organized as per ProDoc, however, none could be launched. The students during interviews shared that they were informed about WEC by the principal of the college, Ismaili Community Center, their relatives, friends, leaflets and parents (this only proves enough information dissemination through non-traditional means, which is an achievement to be highlighted).

The Sunni community in Chital is conservative as compared to Ismaili, therefore, engaging men and boys in such situation could have been a best solution for promoting girls' higher education. Few scholarship awards of residence in WEC for women from Southern Chital will direct the attention of parents to a viable opportunity for the women empowerment. This will pave a way for women higher education in the Southern Chital.

This is worth while to mention that Hashoo Foundation has acceptance in the community and has developed a very good rapport so far. During FGDs with parents and meetings with principals of CGC and CMDC it was noticed that people have great regard for HF and know it for social welfare and developmental organization. The project so far trained more than 300 women on its various modules of LST programme which speaks for the project promotion.

The students recommended women from all over Chital to utilize WEC facility either for residence or LST programme. The group termed these training very essential for empowering women for making best choices about their future.

Findings of FGD with students from

Project Success in Empowering Women to Pursue Higher Education and Employment:

To measure the above mentioned evaluation objective following were questions were inquired by stakeholders;

1. How various stakeholders perceive the provision of quality services of residence and training to women for empowerment
2. Does training produce desired impact on the students to go for higher education or employment

3. Do parents satisfied with the performance of WEC and personal growth of their daughters
4. Confidence building to make choices about future by women

To find out the project success in empowering women for higher education and employment, meetings were carried out with the principals of other educational institutions, parents and boarder and non-boarder students. It was interesting to note that the facilities provided in terms of making WEC a safe place for living in order to build the confidence of parents in sending their daughters to Chitral from far flung areas of the Chitral was greatly appreciated by all the stakeholders.

Meetings / interviews with Mr. Mansoor Ali Shah, Principal City Girls College (CGC) Chitral and Mr. Yar Mohammad, Principal Chital Model Degree College (CMDC) were carried out to find out a comparison of how different WEC is approaching towards women empowerments in Chitral. Both of them have expressed satisfaction over the quality of various facilities offered by WEC for the students. They termed training and exposure through various extra-curricular activities help students in grooming their personality in playing active role in society.



This has been observed that the educational institutes provide hostel facility in order to retain girls in their colleges as residence is one of the biggest problems for women in Chitral. In such situation low-cost residence provided by the educational institutes is compromised by the parents as they can't afford expensive education for their daughters. A comparison of various facilities provided by these colleges in their hostels with WEC has been tabulated and a detail cost efficiency and effectiveness is discussed in later sections of the report. The comparison clearly shows that WEC has ensured to provide safe, secure and healthy environment for women.

Interviews were conducted with following women mostly on jobs undergone LST in WEC on 29th June 2007:

- | | |
|-------------------------|--------------|
| 1. Ms. Rubina | SET teacher |
| 2. Ms. Rahila | - |
| 3. Ms. Sadia | ECD (an NGO) |
| 4. Ms. Farkhanda Jabeen | CT teacher |
| 5. Ms. Irshad Bano | PTC teacher |

Following points were concluded from the interviews carried out with them:

- These training are very much suitable for teachers
- ELT helped very much to attend phone calls especially telephonic interviews
- LST programme helps in attaining job and then retaining it by performing well. I qualified test and interview out of 30 women applied. The training has contributed a lot in my success as I have already applied many other times.

- Being female it is very difficult to go to any private skill center, however, my parents permitted me to join the training at WEC
- Transportation was the biggest motivation for me apart from training itself as women mobility in Chitral is a genuine problem
- Parents in Chitral only prefer safety and security and this has been taken care of by WEC
- Women who reside in WEC and acquire training are well off as compared to non-residents as they don't find enough time to practice all the skills such as EL and ICT. Life Skills can be practiced any where
- Higher education and jobs are not considered as problem at large until there are no co-education or male workers
- All the women interviewed termed themselves as “very different” when asked about their personality and skills before LST

A field Visit to **Booni was carried out on 30th June 2009** to interview a group of women trained in Life Skills Training by HF Chitral in coordination with Al-Karim Foundation. Another field visit was carried out to Dolomultz which is situated at a distance of one and half hour from Chitral Town where FDG with parents and interviews with women conducted.

Booni – a village of Union Council (UC) Charon and sub-division Mastooj - is at a distance of almost 75 km and takes 2 hours to reach from Chitral. One has to travel on the road which is sometime very rough along with mountains and river. Booni has some cultivable land and the people of this area do farming apart from jobs in other parts of the country. There are lots of fruit trees including apple. Booni is a small village and spread over 2 km area. People of this area are very nice, humble, hospitable and very much supportive of girls education. The literacy rate of girls is higher than the boys at Booni, students shared.



Names of the respondents are following:

S. No.	Women/ Students Names	Father Name	Trainee / Boarder
1	Ms. Rahila Qamar	Mr. Qamaruddin	Non-resident trainee
2	Ms. Zakira Amin	Mr. Syed Amin Shah	Non-resident trainee
3	Ms. Mahpara Zaman	Mr. Shah Zaman	Non-resident trainee
4	Ms. Mussarat	Mr. Shah Nisar	Non-resident trainee
5	Ms. Nusrat Fatima	Mr. Shams Ur Rehman	Resident trainee
6	Ms. Sameena	Mr. Rahim Baig	Resident trainee
7	Ms. Tasnim Hayat	Mr. Hayatullah	Resident trainee

Findings:

- Each of the participants has explained that they feel confident, self-reliant and very different as compared to their earlier personality. Positive changes have also been witnessed by their family members in the personality of the women who resided at WEC,

I can take care of my mother's health in a better way as compared to past. I ensure health and hygiene measure at home and recommend my mother to check out Blood Pressure on regular intervals. I am also capable of helping my brother in career planning and identify various opportunities and best educational institutes in the Country for higher education.

Ms. Nusrat Fatima D/O Shams-ur-Rehman
Resident trainee, Booni, UC Charon, Mastooj

trainees mentioned.

- All the participants opined that the LST was very much relevant to them as it helped them in acquiring certain skills which they would have never learnt. According to the residents, the training has brought them almost at par with their classmates in college as students of Chitral area are confident, can speak English well and are very bold. Now after training and exposure opportunities we feel confident to compete with our classmates very easily.
- English language and Information/Communication Technology training was appreciated and termed as helpful and important for the students for acquiring jobs and then retaining it by performing well.
- According to the resident students, the security and safety of the WEC was outstanding and the guards never allowed them to even roam around in hostel compound wall after sun set in order to avoid any mishap. Very high security was sometime taken as surprise by the boarders but this was indeed protecting us and providing safe and secure environment.
- The students recommended WEC facility of HF Chitral for women all over Chitral and LST essential for empowering them for making best choices about future.
- It also came up during the discussion that WEC does not cost high in terms of facilities provided as compared to other hostel privately run by other educational institutes. The transport facility which was free initially during the first year is not free any more in order to improve cost recovery; however, the transportation charges are very nominal.
- The non-resident trainee use to call LST as Hashoo training, probably they were not properly oriented about the training. Training to non-resident women in the remote area under the supervision of non-project staff may not leave the desired impact on trainees.
- Parents won't appreciate an increase in the monthly fee for WEC as the people are mostly poor especially in the remote areas and hence can't afford expensive education. There should have been some financial support mechanism so that concession may be given to women from under privileged poor people in the remote area.

Personal Experiences shared by the students:

- Nusrat shared that she can take care of her mother regarding her health in a better way as compared to past. She can ensure health and hygiene measure at home and recommend her mother to check out Blood Pressure on regular intervals. She also shared that she is now capable to help her brother in career planning and can identify various opportunities and best educational institutes in Islamabad, Rawalpindi and Peshawar.
- Rahila Qamar shared that this has become a usual practice in our society to think negative aspect of any opportunity or idea in the first place and she has to face this while she was deciding to continue further education in Paragon College of Commerce Chitral. The first negative comment she received was that the college has boys too. She argued this by saying that at least she is not going for boys rather for her studies and career. In this way she paved a way for taking admission during this session.
- The group of residents also shared experience about their classmates in Lang Land College Chitral who use to dominate the class quite often as they were very good in studies and confident at the same time. However, WEC's boarders challenged back their classmates with confidence on the basis of proficiency in English language. The challenge resulted in a fast friendship with their classmates.

Capacity Building of Local Partners:

According to the ProDoc, the regional office staff of HF Chitral and the staff of WEC were provided with training on Monitoring & Performance Tools, Narrative and Financial Reporting and on the job project management through PSC meetings. Similarly, LS facilitator has been already working on documentation of the project as well. The WEC training staff is already well versed on LS modules, ICT and ELT. This is worthwhile to mention that the project should have an exit strategy from the project mode to become independent entity and sustainability plan to start generating income from its own resources. Therefore, the regional staff and WEC staff need to be provided training on marketing and sustainability which include control on wastages that can be identified in order to reduce expenditures of the project.

Two (02) two-days (three-days instead) training on monitoring & performance tools were carried out in June 2008 and December 2007. Similarly, a financial & narrative reporting training was held in July 2007 and another in January 2008. Cutting short the number of days in M&E training was not favourable move as this area is technical and need time to conceptualize and practice the skills during the training. The training report of second M&E training held in December 07 clearly reflects that the training, though was very good, but of basic in nature.

The refresher M&E training should have advance level features in it which could possibly helped the IP in improving upon their monitoring and evaluation system by reviewing various performance measurement tools especially statistical information reports. The project lacks a comprehensive management information system (MIS) or a database as required by the monitoring system of the project and prescribed in the ProDoc. It is an important component of M&E system used for timely decision making by the executives about progress and processes of the project. Documentation of training and trainee profile may have been carried out in MS Access or any other database software for easy storage of data and generation of information.

After the training we feel more responsible regarding study and further education. The group agreed that the training had helped them becoming more responsible and responsive.

Resident/non-resident trainees during FGD, Booni, UC Charon, Mastooj

The local partner further strengthened the capacity of the grassroots level organizations (LSOs and VOs) by imparting a 3-days training on Social Mobilization. The local grassroots partners will help in future the project in creating awareness, arranging campaigns, etc.

Lessons Learnt from the Project Approach to Empowering Women:

Lessons learnt during project execution:

- Hiring of ICT trainer on permanent basis has ensured an updated and well maintained computer training center
- Reducing one-year LS cycle to 6-months was helpful in curtailing dropout and maintaining trainees' interest
- Hiring of LS and EL trainers only for short term basis as when required for the training reduced the cost of a training
- Creation of pool of trained HR on LS modules was successful idea to make trainers available despite their regular jobs
- Extending LS training programme to remote area i.e. Booni, for non-residents was not that much successful because rigorous monitoring and supervision are prerequisite for

achieving targets of training. Both these elements were missing at Booni due to budgetary constraints for transportation.

- Sustainability ensured through varying fee structure for each training module, renting out WEC training facilities when residents are on leave.
- Involving LSOs, NGOs and VOs in information dissemination, social mobilization is found helpful in capacity building of local grassroots level organizations as well as in promoting WEC and LST Programme
- Gaps in the training schedule have been effectively addressed by introducing regular training classes during 5 days which reduced the dropout to a greater extent and maintained interest of the trainees.

Lessons learnt from project approach towards women empowerment:

- The idea of women empowerment through WEC facilities and skills training is unique in a remote and conservative area.
- Women of remote area have started feeling confident and started performing and competing well in studies at college with their peers.
- Women are feeling encouraged to pursue higher education and find jobs due to regained confidence and appropriate skills.
- According to the school teachers, LST Programme has helped them in teaching in an effective manner at schools.
- According to students, LST programme is very much effective for WEC residents as compared to non-residents as the former can practice skills in a friendly, healthy and productive environment.

Immediate Impact – Short Case Studies:

- ❁ *One of our school teachers, Ms. Aysha - a graduate from religious institution (Madrassa) – was keen to take part in WEC LST programme. Eventually, she has participated in LST programme and termed it very helpful in building confidence and self-reliance in teachers and students.*
- ❁ *Ms. Nusrat, resident of WEC, shared that she can take care of her mother regarding her health in a better way as compared to past. She also shared that she is now capable to help her brother in career planning and can identify various opportunities and best educational institutes in Islamabad, Rawalpindi and Peshawar.*
- ❁ *Rahila Qamar, non-resident trainer, shared that this has become a usual practice in our society to think negative aspect of any opportunity or idea in the first place and she has to face this while she was deciding to continue further education in Paragon College of Commerce Chitral. The first negative comment she received was that the college has boys too. She argued and won that at least she is not going for boys rather for her studies and career. In this way she paved a way for taking admission during this session.*
- ❁ *The group of residents also shared experience about their classmates in Lang Land College Chitral who use to dominate the class quite often as they were very good in studies and confident at the same time. However, WEC's residents challenged back their classmates with confidence which they gained by proficiency in English language. The challenge resulted in a fast friendship with their classmates.*
- ❁ *Ms. Karishma belongs to Dolomultz and a daughter of a female teacher after inspiring from the LST Program decided to get admission in Software Engineering in Agriculture University Peshawar. She being the only female student among 100 male students in her*

batch is also the first women from Chitral in this discipline which is not usually preferred by the women. She is motivated and encouraged to continue her education even further outside the country.

- ❖ All the participants opined that the LST was very much relevant to them as it helped them in acquiring certain skills which they would have never learnt. According to the residents, the training has brought them almost at par with their classmates in college at Chitral as students of Chitral area are confident, can speak English well and are very bold. Now after training and exposure opportunities we feel confident to compete with our classmates very easily.
- ❖ According to the school teachers, LST Programme has helped them in teaching in an effective manner at schools.

Costs benefit analysis:

The costs benefit analysis of the project were determined through cost efficiency and cost effectiveness of the results achieved.

Cost efficiency:

Table 3: Unit cost of hostel facility charged from a student in Chitral

Institution/ Organization	Admission fee	Monthly fee	Monthly admission fee	Monthly Food	Transport	Total
WEC	1000	2200	1000/12 = 83	Nil	200	2400+83
CCG	2000	1200	2000/12 = 167	500	-	1700+167
CMDC	2000	500	2000/12 = 167	1200	-	1700+167

The above table reflects the cost per student incurred on accommodation, food and transportation in a month. Apparently the cost per student charged by WEC seems quite high as compared to prevailing market prices, however, as per the table 5, the numbers of facilities and quality services that have been provided to students at WEC are far more than offered by other educational institutes at their hostels for the students. Therefore, other factors i.e. residential facilities should also be considered to calculate cost efficiency. During the project duration highest expenditures were recorded in October 2008. The following table shows various expenditures:

Table 4: Statement of Expenditures incurred during October, 2008

Expenses details	Amount	Receipt/income	
Rent	36300	Monthly fee	2200
Utilities	22040	Transport (average)	200
Transport	3200	Training of non-residents	10250
Staff cost	73879		
Food + baverages	192269		
Office maintenance	4650		
Consumable items	2240		
Communication	2468		
Total	337046	Total income during Oct 08	149450
Cost per student @ 58 R + 20 NR trainees	4321	Cost per student @ 58 + 20 NR trainees	1916
Cost per student during 6 months	25926	Cost per student during 6 months	11496
Cost contribution by Project	56%	Cost recovery	44%

The cost efficiency of the project was worked out by comparing the cost per beneficiary during the six months cycle and compared with the cost of the services rendered in the same market. However, since some of the services especially LST were not available in the local market, the estimated comparative rates were calculated and compared with project costs. The LST included social skills, thinking skills, study skills, management skills, employability skills, relationship skills, exploring diversity, academic and career guidance. As the other support costs have been covered under accommodation services in WEC, only the following items were taken into account for calculating the estimated cost of each training in the local market:

- Trainer Cost
- Stationery Cost
- Venue Cost

The total cost per beneficiary at WEC for 6 months was Rs. 25927. The cost has been calculated over the highest expenses in a month i.e. October 2008. This cost includes all the deliverables including accommodation, food, training, transportation, community mobilization and sensitization.

The comparative cost for the same deliverables in the local market excluding community mobilization is estimated to be Rs. 37,802. This estimated cost is calculated through enquiring the rates of accommodation facilities and training offered by other educational institutions other than WEC. The training cost does not include management cost, food cost, module development, coordination cost.

Following is the detail estimated cost calculations according to market:

Cost estimation for only 01 module of LST program in local market:

Trainer cost	= 5,000 per day x 3 days per module	= 15,000
Stationary, multimedia, etc.	= 2,000 per day x 3 days	= 6,000
Venue	= 2,000 per day x 3 days	= 6,000

Total = 27,000

Unit cost estimation for a group of 25 participants on 08 modules of LST Program in local market: $27,000 \times 08 = 216,000 / 25 = \mathbf{8,640 \text{ per trainee}}$

Unit cost estimation for ELT in the market:

1000 monthly fee x 6 months = **6,000**

Unit cost estimation for ICT in the market:

2000 monthly fee x 3 months = **6,000**

Estimated cost of a complete LST program (LST + ELT+ ICT) cycle of 6 months:

$8,640 + 6,000 + 6,000 = \mathbf{22,640}$

Estimated unit accommodation charges for 6 months in the market:

$1867 \times 6 = \mathbf{11,202}$

Estimated unit transportation cost for 6 months in the market:

$\text{Rs. } 30/- \times 22 \text{ days} = 660 \times 6 = \mathbf{3,960}$

By adding unit training, accommodation, transportation costs:

$\mathbf{22,640 + 11,202 + 3,960 = 37,802}$ per beneficiary for 6 months

Hence, the project cost is **32%** efficient as compared to market rates without community mobilization services.

Since the executing agency contributed 50% to the total project cost, this cost sharing makes the project more viable for the funding agency. The income from students fee contributes up to 44% of the cost incurred, which show the strength of sustainability in the project activities.

The project activities can be replicated after the end of the project funding by developing strategies for reducing cost and increased beneficiaries contribution. However to ensure that poor deserving women also get benefit of the services a proper criteria should be devised to offer subsidized rates for the poorest of the poor.

Cost Effectiveness:

The project has been very cost effective as the quality of services rendered has been exceptional in the local market. The WEC has been unique as for as the facilities of the same nature in Chitral are concerned. The responses from various stakeholders consider the services delivered by the project as of highest quality possible.

The residential services offered by other institutions are incomparable with facilities in WEC. The following table provides a sketch of the overall comparison of boarding facilities in WEC with that of the two other available boarding institutions in the local market.

Table 5: Comparison between facilities provided at WEC and Local Market

S. No.	Facility	WEC	Educational institutes 1. City College for Girls (CCG) Chitral 2. Chitral Model Degree College (CMDC)
1	Warden	Available	Student proctor in City College Available in CMDC
2	Wait/ meeting lounge	-do-	Not available (meeting occasionally outside the hostel compound)
3	Visitors	Only 02 identified guardians	No such restriction
4	TV	Available	Not available
5	Sports	Space available for badminton, cricket, and indoor games	Not available
6	Security	Guard (full time) Compound boundary wall	Guard (part time cook) Compound boundary wall
7	Cleanliness	Good	Average
8	Bedding	Bunker beds	Floor bedding
8	Supplies	Mattress, quilts, pillow,	Mattress
9	Dinning	Available	Available
10	Cooking	Cook (full time)	Guard acts as part time cook
11	Menu/Food	Balanced diet includes: chicken, meet, vegetables, eggs, jam, butter, bread, etc. Cooking inside the hostel	Diet is not balanced and does not include much variation. Cooked outside the hostel.
12	Hot water	Arranged in winter	No arrangement
13	Training	LST, ICT and ELT are provided	No training is provided
14	Electric generator	Available	Not available
15	Computer lab	Available	Not available
16	Transportation	For resident/ non-res trainees	Not available
17	Staffing	Sufficiently available	Not available

The quality of food offered in the WEC has been marked high by the beneficiaries. The center ensured the availability of hygienic food with proper check on the cooking services.

These services were found rare and of low quality in other institutions. The availability of transportation to the students is an important value addition to the WEC. Most of the people especially women face a major difficulty of mobility in Chitral. The local transport system is least helpful to women. The fee charged from the students for transportation has been very nominal as compared to the same in the local market.

The capacity enhancement services offered by the project have been of good quality. Most of the training especially LST are not available in the local market which adds to its value for the women in Chitral. Most of the respondents marked the standards of the training at the highest level. The modules have been designed keeping in view the learning gaps of the target group. The training venues and computer labs have been well furnished. The students were quite satisfied with both infrastructure and course contents in terms of quality.

Beside facilities offered in the center the feeling safety and security in the WEC has been appreciated not only by the students but by the parents as well. Most of the people interviewed showed their confidence in the security of the WEC. According to the beneficiaries the friendly and motivating learning environment has added up to building confidence in their selves and they were enabled to compete at national level in academics and professional career. The credit also goes to the repute and good will of Hashoo Foundation in the area. The people of the area appraised the organization very highly and were very confident by sending their women to the center.

Keeping in view the quality of services and benefits of WEC to the women of Chitral, the deliverables of the project are of very high value and cost effective as compared to the services available in the same market.

Conclusion:

In order to attract the attention of community in general and parents in particular in the far flung areas of Chitral, a safe/secure learning environment with basic necessities/services at low cost and of good quality has proved a winning combination. The real aim of the project, which is achieved to a greater extent, was to enable women to consciously make choices for their future by virtue of awareness, confidence, skills and knowledge. According to women interviewed more than 90 percent women termed LST at WEC has competitive advantage over skill development training in the local market which is rare too.

The cost benefit analysis of the project clearly proves that the valuable and quality services offered at WEC are inexpensive as compared to the market where these services are almost unavailable. The project will still be affordable for parents who are mostly aware, sensitized even if the project cost recovery reaches up to 60 percent. The satisfaction of the stakeholders over the services, aims and objectives of the project emphatically dictates the acceptability of the project.

